

## THE FAILURE OF AMISH SETTLEMENTS IN THE SOUTHEASTERN UNITED STATES: AN APPEAL FOR INQUIRY

JAMES E. LANDING\*

Contemporary social scientists interested in the Old Order Amish and their North American settlements are all too painfully aware of the lack of a comprehensive treatise dealing with the totality of Amish diffusion since their coming across the Atlantic. Literature concerning the Amish, both in-group and out-group, is widely scattered, often fugitive, and usually quite specialized in discipline or topical orientation.

New England appears to be the only major division of the United States where the Amish have never settled, and even this information may not be correct. Although more than sixty settlements can be found in the United States and Canada today, probably a much greater number have passed totally out of existence. There have been few studies on Amish site selection, comparative views on the development of differential landscapes, speculations on settlement size to insure success, and other matters that might prove to be of significant value, not only in assessing Amish culture, but in making applications to other minority cultures and to American social mechanisms in general.

The failure of Amish settlements to survive has been especially conspicuous in southeastern United States. Indeed, so little is known about Amish settlement in this area that this writer has frequently been informed that there have not been any Amish settlements in the southeast. The content of this article should help to correct such an impression. Reasons for the failure of Amish settlements, with certain exceptions, to survive in the American southeast become even more significant as these people now begin to move into such areas as British Honduras, Paraguay, and soon, perhaps, to Costa Rica and Brazil. The purpose of this study is, therefore, two-fold: first, to present in a single document as much material as could be found concerning Amish settlements in the southeast, with special emphasis on those about which the least is known; and, to direct an appeal to social scientists in the geographic areas involved to make on-site inquiry concerning the rise and/or fall of such settlements.

Because of the unique cultural attributes of the Amish they lend themselves admirably to study. Their settlement patterns, agricultural methodology, sectarian customs and traditions, language, family names, and other cultural manifestations are easily identified in the environment where they are found. Even after the Amish have left an area they leave a cultural imprint that is difficult to eradicate. Cemeteries, buildings, schis-

\*James E. Landing is teaching in the Department of Geography, University of Illinois at Chicago Circle.

## AMISH SETTLEMENTS IN SOUTHEASTERN U.S.A. 377

matic families, local lore—these linger on to identify the existence of their onetime presence. With the hope that some will become interested in the Amish settlements, past and present, in the American southeast, a state-by-state account of known information is here presented.

### ALABAMA

The only Old Order Amish settlement known to have been established in Alabama was near the town of Bay Minette, Baldwin County, about ten miles northeast of Mobile Bay and several miles east of the village of Hurricane. Dates are uncertain, but the settlement was in existence from about 1912 to 1919.

The settlement was founded by Amish preacher John (Hansi) Bontreger from near Middlebury, Indiana, who moved to Alabama because he thought that "one could live simpler and less worldly in the south."<sup>1</sup> Other Amish families known to have joined Bontreger at Bay Minette were J. J. Glick of Indiana, Enos Swartzentruber and Eli N. Beachy of Ohio, and the J. K. Fisher and C. C. Amstutz families.<sup>2</sup> There were others, since the settlement at one time included nearly fifteen families.

Although the settlement maintained its identity for less than a decade because of the return of most families to the northern states, descendants of some are still found in the Bay Minette area. When Menno Swartzentruber, bachelor son of Enos, moved from Alabama to Delaware in 1917 it is said that there was great rejoicing among the Delaware Amish girls since potential husbands there were in short supply.<sup>3</sup>

By the end of 1919 most of the Amish families had moved away. Eli N. Beachy moved to Stark County, Ohio,<sup>4</sup> and at least two families, including C. C. Amstutz, moved to Kent County, Delaware.<sup>5</sup> A letter from J. K. Fisher in *The Budget*, June 18, 1919, apparently represents the last official communication from an Alabama Old Order Amish family.

### DELAWARE

The Old Order Amish settlement presently located in Kent County, Delaware, about five miles west of Dover, had its origins in 1915 and is the only known Amish settlement to have been founded in the state. The early history of the Amish coming to the area has been well documented by A. B. Clark, history instructor at Wesley College, Dover.<sup>6</sup>

1 N. Zook, *Seeking A Better Country* (Gordonville, Pa.: Old Order Book Society, 1963), 105.

2 H. Hostettler, *Descendants of Jacob Hochstetler: The Immigrant of 1736* (Elgin, Ill.: Brethren Publishing House, 1912), 508, 587, 622; A. B. Clark, *History of the Amish of Delaware* (privately printed, 1963), 26.

3 Clark, 23.

4 *Ibid.*, 26.

5 *Ibid.*, 32.

6 *Ibid.*

The first two Amish families to settle in Delaware were father and son. Jacob K. Miller arrived February 8, 1915, from Norfolk, Virginia, where he had stayed for several months after moving from Oregon.<sup>7</sup> His son, Bishop David Y. Miller, arrived with his family on February 28. By March 7, 1916, they had been joined by the families of William Beachy of Wisconsin, Peter Swartzentruber, and Jake Yoder, son-in-law of Jacob K. Miller. During World War I three of the families moved away and, by 1918, only two remained. The following year, however, Amish families again began to trickle in, including several from Alabama and Mississippi. During 1928 the settlement expanded considerably when a number of families arrived from Reno County, Kansas, where they had experienced considerable discrimination, drought, and the perils of an influenza epidemic.<sup>8</sup> This sudden addition necessitated the division of the settlement into two church districts. Subsequent church district divisions took place in 1933, 1939, and 1960. The present five Old Order Amish church districts, named South, Southwest, Middle, East, and North, are served by three ordained bishops, Eli S. Miller, Jonas J. Colblentz, and John J. Yoder.<sup>9</sup> The total Amish population is about 800 persons, most residing near the villages of Hartley and Wyoming.

The first Amish parochial elementary school in North America, Apple Grove, was established in the Delaware settlement in January 1925. In 1938 Green Hill School was built and a third, Rose Valley, began operation in 1969. The combined enrollment of the three schools is about eighty-two students.<sup>10</sup>

In December 1942 the Dover city governing board passed an ordinance forbidding Amish persons to enter the city because smallpox had been reported among their families. The order was enforced through January of the following year.<sup>11</sup>

During the mid-1940's a considerable amount of dissatisfaction began to be evidenced in the settlement resulting from expressions of many families for changes in Amish traditions. About thirty-six families left

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, 20.

<sup>8</sup> Clark incorrectly states that the families came from Reno, Ford County, Kansas (p. 31). The families moved from Reno County, the Ford County settlement having been abandoned by 1921 (see J. Stoll, *The Lord Is My Shepherd* [Aylmer, Ont.: Pathway Publishing Company, 1965], 174; Stoll lists the names of twenty Amish families that moved from Ford County to Reno County, p. 185).

<sup>9</sup> *Der Neue Amerikanische Kalender*, Baltic, Ohio, 1969, p. 35. The *Kalender* is an annual Old Order Amish publication. It contains lists of ministers for most of the Old Order and Beachy Amish church districts.

<sup>10</sup> "Directory of Schools and Teachers, 1968-1969," *The Blackboard Bulletin*, 12 (1968), 78; "Teacher's Directory," *Ibid.*, 13 (1969), 84. The *Bulletin* is published by the Old Order Amish primarily for the teachers in their parochial schools. Editor is Joseph Stoll, and Pathway Publishing Corporation, Aylmer, Ontario, is publisher.

<sup>11</sup> Clark, 31.

the area and moved to Fauquier County, Virginia, the first group in 1945, and a larger number of families in 1946 and 1947. The later formation of the Central Conservative Mennonite Church near Dover, with a congregation composed mainly of ex-Old Order Amish families, has tended to keep the Old Order population from increasing very rapidly.

#### FLORIDA

There have been at least two Old Order Amish settlements in Florida, one of which, still in existence, began as a retirement community.

About 1962 several Amish families settled in Orange County in the lake district near Zellwood.<sup>12</sup> They were led by Preacher Simon G. Hochstetler and Deacon Dan E. Hershberger. The families apparently stayed only several years.

During the 1920s the area just north of Sarasota on the west coast of the peninsula began to attract winter visitors from among the Amish, Mennonite, and Brethren groups of the northern states. This interest waned during World War II but revived shortly afterward. Many retired Amish, Mennonite, and Brethren families now have permanent homes at Pinecraft in the Sarasota area. The Amish have two resident ministers at Pinecraft, Bishop Menno Swartzentruber and Preacher Moses A. Colblentz.<sup>13</sup>

Many of the Amish families regularly return to the ancestral home or visit relatives in the northern communities during the summer months. This represents a considerable departure from the Amish tradition of simply retiring to a smaller building on the family homestead.

#### GEORGIA

There has never been an Old Order Amish settlement in Georgia, so far as is known, but a group of families which once were affiliated with the Amish in a settlement near Kempsville, Virginia, moved to Macon County about 1959 and established a flourishing community near Montezuma. The congregation is affiliated with the Beachy Amish churches. The group disassociated itself from the Old Order Amish while still in Virginia under the leadership of Bishop Jonas H. Hershberger, who still serves the congregation in Georgia.<sup>14</sup> Other ministers are Simon L. Yoder, Clarence S. Wingard, and Jonas C. Swartzentruber. Baptized membership in the Montezuma settlement exceeds 100 persons.

#### KENTUCKY

There is a single Old Order Amish settlement in Kentucky located in Todd County near the Tennessee border. Mailing addresses for the families are Guthrie and Trenton. The present bishop is Simon M. Yoder,

<sup>12</sup> *Kalender*, 1962, 38.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*, 39.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 40.

preachers are Samuel A. Weaver and Richard Lambright, and the deacon is Noah S. Yoder.<sup>15</sup> The Amish of Kentucky have adopted tractors for use in the farm fields but have maintained their Old Order identity and association, although with some stress in fellowship with other Amish settlements. They established a Christian day school in 1969.

#### MARYLAND

There have been a number of Old Order Amish settlements in Maryland, only two of which have survived. The first settlement was established in Garrett County and was part of the westward movement of Pennsylvania Amish families from Berks and Lancaster counties, and began about 1774.<sup>16</sup> This settlement involved a number of families that also occupied land across the border in Somerset County, Pennsylvania, and Preston County, Virginia (now West Virginia). For many years the congregation was known as the Casselman River church district.

By 1853 the number of families was large enough that the settlement was divided into two church districts with the Pennsylvania-Maryland border serving as the boundary. In 1881 four meetinghouses were built in the Casselman River area, two of which were on the Maryland side. This was a departure from general Amish tradition since worship services are normally held in the homes or barns of members.

During 1895 a severe schism took place which caused the Pennsylvania Amish to discontinue fellowship with those on the Maryland side. The latter group, under the leadership of Bishop Joel Miller, gradually began to lose their Old Order identity and remained independent until 1912 when they merged with the Conservative Amish Mennonite Conference (in 1954 the word "Amish" was officially dropped from the Conference name). Those families that wished to remain Old Order gradually moved away.

During the 1920s disagreements among the Somerset County Amish about what their attitude should be toward those families that associated themselves with the Conservative church in Maryland led to the Beachy Amish schism. Additional controversies centered around the issues of the use of electricity and the purchase of automobiles. In June 1927 the Old Order Amish withdrew from fellowship with Bishop Moses M. Beachy of Salisbury, Pennsylvania, whose followers gradually adopted electricity and automobiles and became the pioneer congregation of the group of churches that now bears the late bishop's name.

A second settlement in Garrett County is still in existence. About 1850 some Amish families began to settle in the southern part of the

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 39.

<sup>16</sup> A. J. Beachy, "The Amish Settlement in Somerset County, Pennsylvania," *MQR*, 28 (1954), 273.

county in the vicinity of Gortner and Oakland, with some families settling in Preston County on the Virginia (now West Virginia) side of the border.<sup>17</sup> The settlement has never been large but has maintained its identity for over a century. The present bishop is Norman Schrock and preachers are Eli D. Beachy and Dan Petershime.<sup>18</sup>

In a comprehensive account of German settlement in Maryland, published in 1948, Amish communities in Frederick County and Washington County are mentioned,<sup>19</sup> but no information has been obtained concerning these settlements which were supposedly located near Hagerstown. There are no Amish settlements in that area at the present time.

In 1833 Moses Miller, of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, settled in the Long Green Valley about 15 miles east of Baltimore. He was soon joined by other families. Apparently Amish identity was maintained until the 1870s when a number of families moved to Tennessee and other areas.<sup>20</sup> For many years the community remained, but with Mennonite identity.

The only other Old Order Amish settlement presently found in Maryland is near the Patuxent River in St. Mary's County. The mailing addresses are Mechanicsville and Charlotte Hall. The families arrived in this area in 1939 because of school controversies in their home area of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania.<sup>21</sup> Maryland, at the time, did not require formal education beyond the seventh grade, a situation much to the liking of the Amish because of their increasing resistance to high school education.

Among the first families were Stephen Stoltzfus and his three sons, Benjamin, Amos, and John. By 1948, there were at least 200 persons in 25 families which were cultivating better than 2,000 acres, with vegetables and tobacco serving as major cash crops.<sup>22</sup> At the present time the settlement is divided into two church districts, Southwest and Northeast, under the leadership of Bishop Samuel J. Stoltzfus. The Amish run three elementary schools near Mechanicsville.

A group of Beachy Amish families left the Dover, Delaware, settlement about 1956 and moved to the Kennedyville and Galena area in Kent County east of Chesapeake Bay. Known as the Chesterton congregation, the group presently has no bishop, but preachers are Rudy J. Yoder and Arthur Martin. Baptized membership is about twenty-seven persons.

<sup>17</sup> *ME* 3, 532.

<sup>18</sup> *Calender*, 1969, 35.

<sup>19</sup> D. Cunz, *The Maryland Germans: A History* (Princeton, N. J.: University Press, 1948), 418.

<sup>20</sup> Zook, 104; G. M. Stoltzfus, *Mennonites of the Ohio and Eastern Conference: From the Colonial Period in Pennsylvania to 1968* (Scottsdale, Pa.: Herald Press, 1969), 149.

<sup>21</sup> Cunz, 419-25.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*

In the 1948 account of the Maryland Germans the following interesting comment is found: "At the end of the 19th century a few Amish families emigrated from South Russia, had first tried their luck in Butler County, Kansas, and had then come to Dorchester County, Maryland, where they settled on the Nanticoke River."<sup>23</sup> No Amish, so far as is known, ever lived in South Russia. During the 1870s there was some small migration to the United States of Mennonite families from that part of western Russia then known as Polish Volhynia. If the Nanticoke River families were actually Amish their history is entirely unknown and their identity has long been lost.

#### MISSISSIPPI

There have been at least five Amish settlements in Mississippi, but none have survived as Old Order.

The first settlement was established near Gibson in Monroe County during the winter of 1895-96 by families from Newton County, Indiana. An interesting account of this settlement is available in a published interview between Joseph Stoll (of Pathway Publishing Corporation) and Joni A. Yoder, who was an eight-year-old boy in one of the first Amish families to arrive in the new settlement.<sup>24</sup> According to Yoder, his father and another Amishman had scouted the area in 1895 because their wives were both in failing health and they desired to move to a warmer climate. Their land transactions were made through a Mr. J. C. Hartly of Oklona, Mississippi, and the settlement site, just west of Gibson, was rich, black, bluestem prairie soil.

Eight families and three single men left Mt. Ayr, Indiana, by train in late 1895, and three additional single men were picked up at Arthur, Illinois. A passenger coach and a box car full of possessions were used for the entire journey. They arrived in Gibson on New Year's Day, 1896. Yoder remembered that the Amish had placed signs on the cars; one of which read "Bound for the Sunny South."

In time eleven other families moved to Gibson from Texas, Indiana, Illinois, Michigan, Ohio, and Virginia. This, coupled with at least nine marriages in the settlement, made a total of nearly twenty-seven families in the area at its peak. The settlement spread across the Monroe

<sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*, 418.

<sup>24</sup> J. A. Yoder and J. Stoll, "My Memories of Mississippi," *Family Life*, v. 2, no. 11 (November, 1969), pp. 36-39; see also J. E. Beachy, "More Memories of Mississippi," *Ibid.*, v. 3, no. 1 (January, 1970), p. 2. For miscellaneous information on the Gibson settlement, see Zook, 104; *Names and Addresses of Mennonite Ministers: 1901* (Elkhart, Ind.: Mennonite Publishing Company); A. K. Yoder, *A History of the Amish South and West of Nappanee, Indiana*, term paper on file with J. C. Wenger, Goshen College, Goshen, Indiana. For correspondence from Gibson Amish families in *The Budget* (Sugar Creek, Ohio), see November 24, 1896, *Supplement*; February 8, 1899; August 25, 1899; August 31, 1899.

and Chickasaw counties border and the Amish built a schoolhouse in each county although the counties supplied the teachers. The school in Chickasaw County was built in 1896, and the one in Monroe County several years later. According to Yoder, both school buildings still stand, one used as a home, the other as a gasoline station.

The Gibson settlement lasted until 1905. During the nine years of its existence there were fifteen deaths and forty-two births among the Amish families. The cemetery remains and is tended by Amish men who journey south periodically to cut the weeds and repair the fences. The apparent reasons for the failure of the settlement, as Yoder remembered, were disease, especially malaria and typhoid fever, and a lack of capacity to work out a satisfactory economic arrangement with the Negro sharecroppers who occupied the same area. The Amish, not being cotton farmers, apparently found the area unsuited for their type of agriculture. Six families, including the Yoder's, moved to Custer County, Oklahoma, during the winter of 1903, and six other families moved at the same time to Anderson County, Kansas. The only Gibson bishop, Andrew Mast, who had been ordained in the settlement in 1898 at the age of twenty-five, moved to Arthur, Illinois, and other families moved to Indiana and Kansas, the last leaving in 1905.

Another Old Order Amish settlement was established in 1927 near Lumberton in Lamar County,<sup>25</sup> where some Mennonite families were living. Amish known to have been in the Lumberton community were Bishop Jacob Byler, Moses Nisley, Eli Yoder, Moses Yoder, and Phineas Bontrager. Apparently most of these families came from Ohio. The settlement lasted until at least 1948, by which time the families had moved away.

Two other extinct Amish settlements in Mississippi were located near Picayune in Pearl River County and in the Gulfport area at Lyman in Harrison County. The former involved some Indiana families including those of Levi M. Hochstetler, Manasses J. Yoder, and Jacob J. Yoder. Dates for these two settlements are uncertain but they were both founded in this century.

In the 1950s a group of Amish farmers settled near Macon in Noxubee County. In 1959 the congregation withdrew from Amish fellowship and joined the Conservative Mennonite Conference under the name of the Magnolia Church. Present membership is about seventy-five baptized persons and the bishop is Edwin Knepp.

#### NORTH CAROLINA

Amish settlers moved into North Carolina on at least two different occasions. The first involved a number of families from Pennsylvania who had by 1764 settled along the Ewarie River in what is now Randolph

<sup>25</sup> *Calender*, 1948, 36.

County.<sup>26</sup> Among the families were a John Mast, a Fisher, and a Beiler. This John Mast had two grand-daughters who were ancestors of President Herbert Hoover, and the late President once forwarded funds for the upkeep of the cemetery where members of this family were buried. Several of these Amish families later moved west and settled in the area near Valle Crucis which, since 1849, has been in Watauga County.<sup>27</sup> There is no evidence, however, that they ever organized a congregation and their Amish identity was quickly lost.

About 1920 a group of Amish settled near Moyock in Currituck County where they farmed newly drained lands on the edge of the Dismal Swamp.<sup>28</sup> Sometime during the decade the settlement was augmented by eight families who moved from an unknown location in Mexico.<sup>29</sup> In 1932, most of the families relocated in Kent County, Delaware, and it is not known how much longer the Moyock settlement was in existence.

#### SOUTH CAROLINA

So far as is known there has never been an Old Order Amish settlement in South Carolina. A group of Beachy Amish, however, recently settled near Allendale in Allendale County. They later severed their Beachy affiliation and now maintain independent status under the name Pilgrims Amish Mennonite Church.<sup>30</sup> Another unaffiliated Amish Mennonite group with seventeen baptized members, headed by Menno J. Schrock, is located in Barnwell County near Williston.<sup>31</sup>

#### TENNESSEE

The Old Order Amish were the first of the Mennonite groups to settle in Tennessee. At least three settlements have disappeared, but two of more recent founding are still in existence.

Deacon John Stoltzfus from near Gap in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, moved into the Beaver Valley and settled near Concord in Knox County in 1871.<sup>32</sup> Other families, including some from Long Green, Maryland, soon followed. They had chosen this settlement because of

26 R. E. Sappington, "The Mennonites in the Carolinas," *MQR*, 42 (1968), 109-110; C. Z. Mast, "Brief Notes on Carolina Mennonites," *Mennonite Historical Bulletin*, v.1, no. 2 (October, 1940), pp. 1, 3.

27 Sappington, 110.

28 J. E. Landing, *American Essence: A History of the Peppermint and Spearmint Industry in the United States* (Kalamazoo, Mich.: Kalamazoo Public Museum, 1969), 81.

29 Clark, 26, 32; J. E. Landing, "The Old Order Amish in Mexico," *Mennonite Historical Bulletin*, v. 30, no. 4 (October 1969), p. 6; H. Hostetler *Descendants of Barbara Hochstedler and Christian Stutzman* (Scottsdale, Pa.: Mennonite Publishing House, 1938; reprinted Berlin, Ohio: Gospel Book Store, 1965), 1235.

30 *Mennonite Yearbook and Directory*, Scottsdale, Pa., 59 (1968), 82.

31 *Ibid.*

32 Zook, 104; H. A. Brunk, *History of Mennonites in Virginia* (Staunton, Va.: McClure Printing Company, 1959), v. 1, p. 436.

the cheapness of the land following the Civil War.<sup>33</sup> Settlement was rapid, since fifty-four persons, twenty-one of whom were baptized, were in the Valley by 1872.<sup>34</sup>

Stoltzfus was the grandson of Christian Stoltzfus who had been one of the pioneer Amish bishops of Pennsylvania. The deacon became known among the Amish as "Tennessee John" and was the reported author of a pamphlet titled *From the Time of Our Fathers to the Present Time*.<sup>35</sup> "Tennessee John" was known as an eccentric and alienated some of his congregation by giving "exhortations."<sup>36</sup> He was ordained a bishop but departed from many of the traditions of the Amish group. He is known to have baptized two of his grandchildren by immersion in a creek. His congregation eventually asked him to discontinue his preaching, but this left the Amish leaderless. Stoltzfus died in 1887 and many of the families drifted back north. Quite a few, however, joined the Mennonites who had also begun to settle nearby in the meantime. Within several years the Amish identity was lost.

By 1890 an Old Order Amish settlement was established near McEwen in Dickson County but it lasted only several years.<sup>37</sup> A Seth J. Miller family from Illinois may have lived in this settlement.

In 1945 Amish families from the vicinity of Apple Creek, Ohio, began settling near Ethridge and Summertown in Lawrence County. There were eleven families present within a year and seventeen by the end of 1946.<sup>38</sup> Early ministers were Joseph F. Zook and Peter J. Gingerich. By 1953 the settlement was divided into two church districts, East and West. Eli J. Hochstetler, ordained in 1961, was the first to serve this group as bishop.

About 1948 several of these families, including ministers Phineas M. Bontreger and Jacob D. Mast, settled slightly to the northwest near Hohenwald in Lewis County but soon moved away.<sup>39</sup> Some settled near Holladay in Benton County just west of the Tennessee River. This community is still in existence; its bishop is Mahlon J. Mast and its deacon David M. Troyer. The combined population of the two contemporary Tennessee Amish settlements, Ethridge and Holladay, is estimated at better than 200.

#### VIRGINIA

There have been at least five Old Order Amish settlements in Virginia. Two have become extinct, one survives, and two others have become Beachy Amish.

33 Zook, 104.

34 Brunk, 436.

35 Zook, 104.

36 Brunk, 436.

37 *ME*, 4, 694.

38 *Calender*, 1947, p. 36; 1946, p. 36.

39 *Ibid.*, 1948, p. 35; *The Budget*, letters from Hohenwald, Tennessee, June 10 and June 29, 1948.

The first known Virginia Amish settlement was founded in Fauquier County near the towns of Midland and Bealeton. The dates are uncertain, but in 1895 Bishop Cornelius Beachy of Midland was called to mediate the dispute between the Maryland and Pennsylvania Amish.<sup>40</sup> Other Amish families in the area about that time were Joseph Bontreger, Benjamin Smoker, Daniel Hershberger, D. C. Yoder, and Christian Glick.<sup>41</sup> "It is reported that the Amish did not remain in the community; they were in and out."<sup>42</sup> Beachy and Bontreger were serving as bishops in 1901, but only Bontreger was listed in 1903,<sup>43</sup> the last year the settlement was known to have been in existence.

About 1903 Smoker and Hershberger of Bealeton relocated east of Norfolk in Princess Anne County in the triangular area between the towns of Lynnhaven, Kempsville, and Princess Anne.<sup>44</sup> The settlement continued to attract families and became quite large. In 1923 a number moved to Delaware,<sup>45</sup> and a group, led by Bishop Daniel J. Stutzman and ministers Ezra Troyer and Levi Miller, moved to the west near Portsmouth in 1936.<sup>46</sup> There were ten families near Portsmouth at one time, but only five remained in 1943. Before long all had returned to the Princess Anne area.

The Beachy Amish division erupted in the Princess Anne settlement in 1942 under the leadership of ministers Simon L. Yoder, Jacob J. Hershberger, and Jonas H. Hershberger. Immediately Old Order families began to move out and relocated in the Shenandoah Valley near the towns of Stuart's Draft and Staunton in Augusta County. Led by Bishop Simon D. Schrock and Preacher Eli M. Yoder, there were sixteen families by 1948. But this attempt to flee from the Beachy Amish influence proved futile and in 1956 the schism erupted in their new surroundings. At the present time there are both Old Order and Beachy congregations in the Stuart's Draft area, the latter with a baptized membership of forty-two. The Stuart's Draft School, founded in 1966, has a present enrollment of seventy-nine.

In the meantime Old Order families continued to leave the Princess Anne settlement and the entire remaining congregation affiliated with the Beachy Amish churches. Jonas H. Hershberger became bishop in 1945 and he and a number of followers formed the group that moved to Montezuma, Georgia, about 1959. The present leader of the Kempsville

40 Beachy, 281; J. E. Landing, "Exploring Mennonite Settlements in Virginia," *The Virginia Geographer*, 4 (1969), 6-12.

41 Brunk, 440.

42 *Ibid.*

43 *Names and Addresses of Ministers*, 1901 and 1903.

44 Zook, 92.

45 Clark, 37.

46 *Calender*, 1937, p. 35.

Beachy Amish church is Preacher Ezra E. Troyer and the baptized membership is 152.

In 1946 Amish families from Delaware, dissatisfied with the Beachy Amish tendencies in that area, began to settle once again in Fauquier County, but this time near Catlett. They were led by Bishop William Byler and ministers Rudy W. Byler and Simon W. Byler. Once again the flight proved futile and the Old Order identity at Catlett was almost totally extinguished in 1960 when a Beachy schism took place under the leadership of Bishop Dan J. Nissley. The few dissatisfied Old Order families moved away. The Catlett Beachy Amish church has a baptized membership of forty-two. The Pine Grove School, founded by the Old Order in 1956, was taken over by the Beachy people and has a present enrollment of thirty.

A number of Amish families settled at a very early date in Preston County, an area which was later incorporated into West Virginia. These families, located near the communities of Aurora, Breedlove, Brookside, Eglon, and Horse Shoe Run, never formed an independent congregation since they were an integral part of the settlements founded in Garrett County, Maryland, near Gortner and Grantsville.

#### WEST VIRGINIA

There has never been an Old Order Amish settlement, so far as is known, in West Virginia. However, before the Civil War some Amish families belonging to the Garrett County, Maryland, settlements occupied land in Preston County, Virginia, which later became part of West Virginia.

#### SUMMARY

Information has been presented on thirty Old Order Amish settlement sites known to have been established or mentioned in the literature in the southeastern states. An attempt has been made to pull the scattered literature regarding these settlements together to provide a springboard for future inquiry as to why Old Order Amish settlement has been so unsuccessful in this area, since twenty-two of the thirty settlements have passed into oblivion. A brief table can summarize the historical status of these settlements.

| STATE                      | Known Settlement Sites | Extinct | Contemporary |
|----------------------------|------------------------|---------|--------------|
| Alabama                    | 1                      | 1       | 0            |
| Delaware                   | 1                      | 0       | 1            |
| Florida                    | 2                      | 1       | 1            |
| Kentucky                   | 1                      | 0       | 1            |
| Maryland                   | 7                      | 5       | 2            |
| Mississippi                | 5                      | 5       | 0            |
| North Carolina             | 2                      | 2       | 0            |
| Tennessee                  | 5                      | 3       | 2            |
| Virginia and West Virginia | 6                      | 5       | 1            |
| Total                      | 30                     | 22      | 8            |

In addition, information concerning Beachy Amish settlements in the above states, Georgia, and South Carolina is also presented.

With the exception of the original Garrett County, Maryland, and Gibson, Mississippi, settlements, practically nothing is known about the extinction mechanisms which have operated in Old Order Amish settlements in the southeastern United States. Although the major reasons are known in general for some of the more recent extinctions, such as Beachy schisms, the actual operational mechanics have yet to be authenticated and documented.

That this is true for the southeast does not imply that it is true for North America in general. The return to Mennonitism of the great majority of the nineteenth century Amish immigrant families has been treated in numerous Mennonite histories. Several studies have dealt with the extinction mechanism in Pennsylvania,<sup>47</sup> and John Umble's extensive work on Amish and Mennonite congregations in Ohio still looms as a necessary historical reservoir.<sup>48</sup> But there still remains a dearth of intensive investigations of single settlements comparable to those of Mook and Landing,<sup>49</sup> and an almost total absence of on-site comparative studies in which the Old Order Amish are differentiated from their neighbors.<sup>50</sup>

Social scientists in the southeastern states have a fertile field of pursuit in examining Old Order Amish settlements, past and present, and making genuine contributions to a better understanding of the problems of minority cultures in relationship to the totality of American social processes. It is sincerely hoped that this presentation will provoke such inquiry.

47 G. M. Stoltzfus, "History of the First Amish Mennonite Communities in America," *MQR*, 28 (1954) 235-62; M. A. Mook, "Extinct Amish Mennonite Communities of Pennsylvania," *MQR*, 30 (1956), 267-76.

48 For one example, see John Umble, "Why Congregations Die: A Summary of the Causes for the Decline of Certain Ohio Congregations," *Mennonite Historical Bulletin*, v. 8, no. 4 (October, 1947), pp. 1-3.

49 M. A. Mook, "The Amish Community at Atlantic, Pennsylvania," *MQR*, 28 (1954), 293-301; J. E. Landing, "The Amish and Mennonite Settlement at Nappanee, Indiana," *Family Life*, v. 2, no. 6 (June, 1969), pp. 38-39; *idem*, "Geographic Models of Old Order Amish Settlements," *The Professional Geographer*, 21 (1969), 238-43; *idem* "The Old Order Amish Settlement at Nappanee, Indiana: Oldest in Indiana," *Mennonite Historical Bulletin*, v. 30, no. 4 (October, 1969), p. 5.

50 For one example, see J. E. Landing, "Personal Decision Expressed in Agriculture," *Bulletin of the Illinois Geographical Society*, 12 (1969), 69-77.

## RESEARCH NOTES

### CONRAD GREBEL ON THE INDEX

IRVIN B. HORST

Conrad Grebel (*ca.* 1498-1526) figured notably in the rise of humanism and reformation at Zurich during the early 1520s, but his career was cut short by an early death. It is not certain that his one sizable writing in the vernacular, the so-called "Taufbüchlein," ever saw print; at least no copy is recorded. Three occasional writings in Latin, however, were published in works by Joachim Vadianus (von Watt) and Ulrich Zwingli. Two are brief verse compositions and the third is a preface of two folio pages to Vadianus' second edition of Pomponius Mela, *De situ orbis*, published by Andreas Cratander at Basel in 1522.<sup>1</sup> This last item in particular fell under censure and probably gave occasion for Grebel's name to be placed on the *Index*. The purpose of this note is to trace briefly this entry in various editions of the *Index* and in certain regional lists of prohibited books.

Grebel's name first appeared on the *Index* of 1564, the list of prohibited books authorized by Pope Pius IV and generally known as the Tridentine *Index*.<sup>2</sup> This was the second of the lists published in connection with the Council of Trent; the 1559 *Index* of Pope Paul IV did not contain Grebel's name, but this is not surprising for the list was not very comprehensive and met much criticism in this regard.<sup>3</sup> In the Tridentine *Index* the authors were placed in three classes according to the extent of censure. Grebel appeared in the first class, "Auctores primae classis," which meant that all of his writings were under the ban. Authors such as Martin Luther, Ulrich Zwingli, and Menno Simons were also in this class. Erasmus of Rotterdam, for example, appeared in the second class, "Certorum auctorum libri prohibiti," and the books under censure were then listed by title. Even the 1564 *Index* was severely criticized by ecclesiastical authorities in Spain, and in 1571 Pope Pius V established a special Congregation of the Index to make it more definitive and up to date. By 1664 it was decided to abandon the three-class division and instead to list all authors alphabetically with certain significations after the names. An "o.o." after the name of Grebel or Menno Simons stood for "opera omnia" and indicated that all writings were prohibited. Grebel's name remained on the *Index* through these various revisions until at least 1726.<sup>4</sup>

In the 1564 *Index* Grebel's name was recorded as "Conradus Gibelus Tigurinus," and this form was retained in most later editions. Reusch in his critical text edition of the *Indices* correctly amends this entry with "vel Grebellius." The *Index* itself in some later editions makes a similar addition, as for example, "Conradus Gibelus, vel Grebellius Tigurinus," in the edition authorized in 1590 by Pope Sixtus V.<sup>5</sup> Thus Reusch is right in his identification, and the appearance of Grebel's name on the *Index* is not in doubt.

The name "Index" in a strict sense refers to the papal list of prohibited books. This was first drawn up at the Council of Trent and published then and later through many revised editions with the authorization of the Holy See. *Index librorum pro-*

1 For a list of writings of Conrad Grebel see Harold S. Bender, *Conrad Grebel* (Goshen, 1950), 298-99.

2 F. H. Reusch, *Die Indices Librorum Prohibitorum des sechzehnten Jahrhunderts* (Tübingen, 1886; reprint, Nieuwkoop, 1961), 256.

3 Reusch, *Der Index der verbotenen Bücher* (Bonn, 1883-85), I, 258f.

4 *Index Librorum Prohibitorum* (Prague, 1726). This is a reprint of the *Index* authorized by Innocent XI in 1681; the entry for Grebel on page 82 is "Conradus Gibelus, vel Grebellius Tigurinus. I Cl."

5 Quotation is from the Cologne, 1597 ed., C3r; the Rome, 1590 ed. in Reusch, *Indices*, 469, is not amended.